Peer Review Guidelines and Form

Peer Review Forms due: Tuesday, December 2

Here are some general guidelines for peer review:

- Read the paper through twice. First, get the general sense of the paper, and then read it to answer (in writing) the questions on the peer review form (see template for Peer Review attached).

- Explain all your responses: don’t just write “yes” or “no.”

- Make your comments useful and constructive. Always point to a particular part of the paper (that is, don’t just say “your transitions are unclear”; say “sometimes transitions are unclear; consider the second paragraph on page 2”), and don’t just point out problems without suggesting ways to fix them!

- Respect the author’s viewpoint: don’t suggest that the author rewrite the paper because you disapprove of his or her approach or topic.

- The Peer Review Workshop will be held during class on Tuesday, December 2: For each paper assigned to you bring the filled Peer Review form and the original draft (you may make additional comments on the draft, if you wish) to discuss with, and hand it to, your authors.
Peer Review Form

Author's name:

Reviewer's name:

Content
Did the author provide an appropriate amount of background?

Did the author present the topic in an appropriate level of detail?

Organization
Does the paper's organization make the author's argument clear and easy to follow?

Can the introduction and conclusion be strengthened? If so, how?

Mechanics
Did the author cite all of his or her sources adequately?

Is the author's writing style clear and appropriate for this paper?

Did the author achieve a nice flow? Are the transitions between topics smooth?

General
What are the strongest parts of this draft?

What are the two most important things for the author to focus on in revisions?

(Ripped shamelessly from the Manoa Writing Program's website.)